overSEAS 2022

This thesis was submitted by its author to the School of English and American Studies, Eötvös Loránd University, in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts. It was found to be among the best theses submitted in 2022, therefore it was decorated with the School's Outstanding Thesis Award. As such it is published in the form it was submitted in **overSEAS 2022** (http://seas.elte.hu/overseas/2022.html)

DIPLOMAMUNKA
MA THESIS

Rácz Lilian
Anglisztika MA
Angol irodalom szakirány

2022

EÖTVÖS LORÁND TUDOMÁNYEGYETEM
Bölcsészettudományi Kar

DIPLOMAMUNKA
MA THESIS

Zene és a modernista regény: Forster, Joyce, Woolf

Music and the Modernist Novel: Forster, Joyce, Woolf

Témavezető:

Dr. Remport Eglantina
egyetemi adjunktus

Készítette:

Rácz Lilian
Anglisztika MA
Angol irodalom szakirány

2022

CERTIFICATE OF RESEARCH

By my signature below, I, Rácz Lilian certify that my ELTE MA thesis, entitled *Music and the Modernist Novel: Forster, Joyce, Woolf* is entirely the result of my own work, and that no degree has previously been conferred upon me for this work. In my thesis I have cited all the sources (printed, electronic or oral) I have used faithfully and have always indicated their origin. The electronic version of my thesis (in PDF or ZIP format) is a true representation (identical copy) of this printed version.

If this pledge is found to be false, I realize that I will be subject to penalties up to and including the forfeiture of the degree earned by my thesis.

Date: Budapest, 19 April 2022 Signed: Rácz Lilian s.k.

ABSTRACT

The aim of this thesis is to examine the relationship between music and the early twentieth-century modernist novel. Inspired by the role of the regularly reappearing Vinteuil sonata in Marcel Proust's *À la recherche du temps perdu* (1913-1927), E. M. Forster put forward his theory of rhythm in *Aspects of the Novel* (1927), claiming that some novels contain themes – rhythms – around which the structure of the novel is constructed. This thesis argues that some of the most innovative writers of the modernist period such as Forster, James Joyce, and Virginia Woolf used music and rhythm as organising forces, leitmotifs, in an effort to reimagine the traditional novel form and structure, creating a special sense of musicality in their prose.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction 1

1. Rhythm in Theory 4

 1.1. Music in Twentieth-Century Culture 4

 1.2. *Aspects of the Novel* and Music 7

 1.3. Proust and the Arts 11

2. E. M. Forster 15

 2.1. Building a Motif System 15

 2.2. Reading the "Elusive" Forster 16

 2.3. Music and the Marabar Echo in *A Passage to India* 19

3. Virginia Woolf 26

 3.1. Music and Musicality in Woolf's Life 26

 3.2. A Musical Rethinking of the Novel Form: Woolf and Joyce 29

 3.3. The Musicalisation of *Mrs Dalloway* 32

Conclusion 41

Works Cited 42

INTRODUCTION

"After silence, that which comes nearest to expressing the inexpressible is music."

Aldous Huxley

After the *fin de siècle*, an era of prosper in culture, writers found many of their experiences difficult to conceptualise. For this reason, the role of music in literature and culture grew in significance, and writers like E. M. Forster, James Joyce, and Virginia Woolf decided to include music into some of their most important writings. These modernist authors, especially Joyce but even at times Woolf, have long been deemed 'difficult' to read; the language and the structure of some of their writings seem to elude even the readiest of readers and critics. Yet, if its inherently rhythmic nature is taken into careful consideration, music contributes much to the birth of a literary interpretation. The reason for this is that music helps guide the attention to the most relevant points in the text (O'Callaghan 14-15). The crucial role of music for the modernist writer, the reader, and the analyst thus prompts further inquiry into how modernist writers have included musicality in their texts.

This thesis concerns itself with the novels of Edward Morgan Forster and Virginia Woolf especially. What these authors have in common in their respective works is not the mere presence of music in both form and content but, as this thesis shall argue, the representation of musicality as rhythm in their prose. This representation denotes a specific kind of rhythm that signifies a recurring theme connected to expressing phenomena that are impossible to say or show otherwise; a theme that creates tensions and releases in human relationships and communication. Furthermore, the involvement of Marcel Proust and James Joyce in this thesis is also necessary for the discussion of music in the modernist novel to be complete. Marcel Proust's influence on the early twentieth-century, modernist English novels is of great importance. Taking his example for the explanation of the 'easier' rhythm in *Aspects of the Novel* (1927) from *À la recherche du temps perdu*

(1913-1927), Forster much depends on Proust's oeuvre to provide his theory a literary background. James Joyce is a figure of high modernist literature who had a strong connection with music – a connection that Michelle Witen's *James Joyce and Absolute Music* (2018) examines in great detail. An extensive exploration of the relationship between the musical rhythm and the Joycean prose would thus be reasonable given the innovative nature of Joyce's texts in both form and content, especially as regards *Ulysses* (first published in whole in 1922). Yet, this is unfortunately rendered impossible due to the limited scope of this thesis, which provides opportunity for a more modest look into Joyce only. This also allows for the thesis, however, to discuss Forster's theory and its application found in his novel and that of Virginia Woolf in that much more detail.

Forster's educated sensitivity towards literature coupled with Woolf's ingenious creativity in the novel genre gives birth to the idea of musicalizing the structure of the novel, or, in other words, conveying the idea of the novel form in terms of music. This can be seen in such critical and creative writings as Forster's *Aspects of the Novel* (1927) and *A Passage to India* (1924) as much as the personal notes and celebrated novels of Virginia Woolf. *Aspects of the Novel* is Forster's critical study on the novel genre in which he presents his arguments for the existence of the rhythm and its detectable presence in some important literary works such as Marcel Proust's *À la recherche*. This thesis centralises *A Passage to India* among the works of Forster for two reasons. First, it is his most mature novel as it was his last finished piece in the genre. What is more, the 1924 publishing of *A Passage to India* falls closest to the 1927 publishing of *Aspects*, which suggests the proximity of the maturation of the critical thought that was first put into his creative, then to critical writing – his theory of the rhythm. Second, as regards its literary value, *A Passage to India* is probably the most critically acclaimed Forsterian prose writing (Childs 188). Elizabeth Langland points out in her essay in *The Cambridge Companion to E. M. Forster* (2007) entitled "Forster and the Novel" that it is a novel that displays "modernist" features (101) which is indeed reinforced by David Medalie in *E. M. Forster's Modernism* (2002) when he calls *A Passage to India* "one fully fledged and seminal modernist work" (2). *A Passage to India*, nonetheless, has not been examined as to how it relates to

the modernist way of connecting music and the novelistic form. This thesis shall argue that such a connection is presented by his theory of the rhythm as presented in *Aspects of the Novel*.

As to Virginia Woolf, the attempt to examine *Mrs Dalloway* through the lens of music and the Forsterian rhythm seems reasonable. Even though many of her novels (*Voyage Out*, 1915; Orlando, 1927; *The Waves,* 1931) involve music either in their content or in their structure, critical works exploring the connection of Woolf and music tend not to take *Mrs Dalloway* as their focus. For instance, *Virginia Woolf and Classical Music: Politics, Aesthetics, Form* (2013) by Emma Sutton focuses on Woolf's *Voyage Out*, while *Virginia Woolf and Music* (2014) edited by Adriana Varga, though involves an analysis of *Mrs Dalloway* (also written by Emma Sutton entitled "Flying Dutchmen, Wandering Jews: Romantic Opera, Anti-Semitism, and Jewish Mourning in Mrs Dalloway"), it explores the relationship of the novel to opera and Jewishness solely. The contributions which focalise Woolf in *Essays on Music and Language in Modernist Literature* (2018) edited by Katherine O'Callaghan concern themselves with Woolf's most experimental novel, *The Waves* as it relates to Richard Wagner. It seems, therefore, that *Mrs Dalloway* has so far remained mostly uncharted territory in terms of its relationship to music and musicality. This thesis offers to explore exactly this relationship in *Mrs Dalloway* besides Forster's work, regarding music not as content but as a formal feature with the ability to organise the structure of the novel.

1. Rhythm in Theory

1.1. Music in Twentieth-Century Culture

Walter Pater, an English essayist, literary critic, and one of the most influential aesthetes in world literature writes in *The Renaissance* (1893), his manifesto of Aestheticism that the goal all art wants to reach is a point where matter is not to be considered whole without its form. He explains that "all art constantly aspires towards the condition of music" precisely because it has achieved an indivisible union of form and matter which other art forms cannot recreate (106). As regards art forms other than music, in fact, form and matter are clearly divided and distinguishable. Due to this, music was thought superior to them (including literature) which is, as far as comparisons go, unhelpful and unwelcome since it reinforces an uncomfortable feeling of hierarchy between art forms instead of encouraging a process of striving for joint understanding and evolution (O'Callaghan 1). Modernist writers, nevertheless, could not help but wonder whether it was possible to create this mysterious oneness in literature, a divine harmony only music has been so far able to achieve. Importantly, instead of trying to convert literature into music, with the help of the latter they carefully examined the delicate relationship between literary form and content, and utilised the features normally linked with music as if those were inherently part of literature itself as much as music. Besides taking into consideration the innate musicality of language, authors saw a potential in constructing a novel structure explicitly or implicitly centring around music (O'Callaghan 1-2). This means that the structure was based on patterns, rhythm, and on creating motifs, even leitmotifs of music in some way which may or may not have seen the whole novel (or novels) through. Such was the case, famously, with the Vinteuil sonata in Proust's *À la recherche* which served as inspiration for many of the modernist writers who were greatly influenced by his work.

Since the value of music in literature had been recognised much earlier than the twentieth century, the introduction of music into novels was not a modernist invention. Before the eighteenth

century, when the genre was not yet widespread, drama and especially poetry relied naturally on music. All of Shakespeare's plays contained music or musicality in some form, sometimes via the mentioning of music, other times via the inclusion of actual folk music and parts of ballads known to the public (see *A Midsummer Night's Dream*, *Othello*, or *Romeo and Juliet*). The blank verse and the many sonnets in the English renaissance (from Wyatt to Shakespeare) as well as the frequent use of heroic couplets in the English neoclassicism (from Dryden to Pope) demonstrate the musicality of poetry clearly. In terms of prose, Victorian literature features music heavily, a good example for which is a rather obscure Victorian novel by Elizabeth Sheppard entitled *Charles Auchester* (1853). The "charm [of the novel] (…) lies in its obvious adoration of music, musicians, and all things musical", as D. J. Smith emphasises (519). Music is also a recurrent theme in novels such as *Under the Greenwood Tree* (1872) by Thomas Hardy or *Daniel Deronda* (1876) by George Eliot. Zsolt Bojti also reinforces the importance of music in the Victorian novel, arguing that Oscar Wilde's work, *A Picture of Dorian Gray* (1890) and *Teleny* (an 1893 novel widely attributed to Wilde) both foreground the idea of music in relation to the possibility (or impossibility) of expressing homosexuality and homoeroticism (82-96). The way music and homoeroticism are connected has been studied, for instance, by David Deutsch in *British Literature and Classical Music* (2015) especially due to Forster's explicitly homoerotic novel *Maurice* (written around 1913-1914, posthumously published in 1971).

Music played an integral role in the quotidian of British people in the nineteenth and the first half of the twentieth century. Deutsch argues that from 1870, classical music and musical education came into a period of flourishing with an Education Act of 1870, the foundation of the Guildhall School of Music around 1880, the opening of the Royal College of Music in 1883, with the affordably priced concerts of classical music regularly held in the Queen's Hall Promenade and the Royal Albert Hall, and much later with the appearance of BBC (5). The turn of the century and the first half of the twentieth century together constituted an era where arts, literature, and society were hit with waves of unforeseen change. This change happened due to stepping into a new,

undiscovered century, the two world wars, and rapid advancement in technology, science, and general knowledge about humans. Virginia Woolf marked this paradigm shift – now considered to be the beginning of modernism – in her essay "Mr Bennet and Mrs Brown":

> The change was not sudden or definite like that. But a change there was, nevertheless; and since one must be arbitrary, let us date it about the year 1910. (…) All human relations have shifted (…). And when human relations change there is at the same time a change in religion, conduct, politics, and literature. (4-5)

Significant pioneers of this new wave of writers were Dorothy Richardson, James Joyce, and Virginia Woolf. E. M. Forster himself was also in favour of several points made by the new movement, albeit his relationship to modernism is contested to this day (see "Chapter 13" by Randall Stevenson in *The Cambridge Companion to E. M. Forster*, or for a more comprehensive examination, *E. M. Forster's Modernism* by David Medalie).

It became pressingly clear in the early twentieth century that such framework which did not seek to bring form and content as close together as possible in the novel was not going to be able to reflect the general twentieth-century experience. As O'Callaghan puts it, modernist literature itself is "a correction to the allegedly shallow vision of nineteenth-century realist modes, which failed to question a narrative vehicle of literature in a manner to which the modernists aspired" (2). Therefore, writers sought ways in which literature could, in fact, manage to present the thoughts and concerns of the modern age. To rethink the novel, authors set out to include some of the most recent findings of science and the most definitive parts of their contemporary culture and thought. Firstly, the writing style began to centre around the internal monologue and a recently formed technique called 'stream of consciousness'. Since these techniques were closely connected to the newly discovered fields of psychology and psychoanalysis, they necessitated as well as showcased a deep understanding and detailed portrayal of the workings of the human mind. Secondly, conventionalised features of the genre related to temporality, characterisation, and the previously conceptualised relationship between form and content were all brought under the scope. In these

topics Marcel Proust's seminal work, *À la recherche du temps perdu* established his authoritative voice in both French and English early twentieth-century literature. Indeed, his epic *roman fleuve* had an undoubtedly great influence on the Bloomsbury Group for whom Proust quickly became "the most revered French writer" (Caws and Wright 11). Finally, since music "can stand as a marker of what is unspoken in literature, a space to acknowledge moments of inexpressibility" (O'Callaghan 2), it was found to be able to continue the 'communication' in literature whenever language fails – and failing language was one of the most noteworthy experiences in the twentieth century.

The new concept of the role of music in literature is what Forster and Woolf, alongside others, wished to build into their prose, though not only in an effort to reform content but also to reimagine the form: to revolutionise the novel as it was known to them. Centuries had passed since the birth of the genre in the early eighteenth century with the publication of Daniel Defoe's *Robinson Crusoe* (1719), and albeit several topics were still relevant in modern times, many twentieth-century concerns could not be expressed in the traditional form of the novel. Yet to be joined by authors of the 'new era', Henry James was one of the first innovative writers at the end of the nineteenth century whose efforts to reimagine English prose ended fruitfully (see, for instance, the complex temporal and narrative structure of *The Turn of the Screw*, 1898). The new way of looking at and utilising music especially in literature was to be extremely helpful for writers who longed to find new ways of expressing the inner world of the human mind in its newly discovered complexity.

1.2. *Aspects of the Novel* and Music

A well-educated man and a contemplative theorist, E. M. Forster read Classics and history from 1897 until 1901 at King's College, Cambridge. His education was not only crucial in terms of the acquired knowledge and academic experience, but also as regards the social connections he came to possess during his time at the university. Elected in 1901 to the Apostles (or 'Conversazione Society'), an intellectual society whose focus was the discussion of prevalent and contemporary philosophical, religious, and moral problems, Forster met fellows such as Lytton Strachey, Leonard

Woolf, and John Maynard Keynes (Medalie, "Bloomsbury" 35). These men went on to become members of the famous Bloomsbury Group, a London-based group of intellectuals whose lives were intertwined through not only close friendships and relationships but also via their unanimous wish to look at art from a fresh, "daringly modern" perspective (Medalie, "Bloomsbury" 35). The scope of the group did widen later by the significant addition of the Stephen sisters, Vanessa and Virginia.

Given the intellectually stimulating surroundings and the inherently difficult task of expressing complex ideas in novels authentically, it is somewhat unsurprising that he himself created a piece of literary theory contemplating the novel and its 'aspects'. Originally, he gave a series of lectures in the topic in 1927 at Trinity College, Cambridge, and a few months later in 1927 it was published entitled *Aspects of the Novel*. Now considered quite influential, *Aspects* considers the most crucial building blocks of the novel genre structurally and content-wise. These blocks coincide with the chapters, of which a few are "The Story", "The Plot", and "Pattern and Rhythm". Explaining the creative process of some aspects of novel writing such as the story and the plot, characterisation, the author, and the atmosphere through literary examples, Forster demonstrates a clear understanding of certain pieces of literature in light of his own theories (like his theory of the round and flat characters in novels). In this comprehensive critical work, Forster makes an effort to understand and explain other writers' work with a great amount of originality as well as subjectivity, which, in turn, helps the process of understanding his own way of thinking and writing method. By explaining others, he explains himself. Though many factors that influence both content and form are touched upon in *Aspects*, the structure and form of the novel are of special interest since these aspects enlighten possible ways of interpreting some of Forster's more elusive works.

Recognising the lack of terminology for addressing the phenomenon later called rhythm, Forster draws on notions of 'pattern' and 'rhythm' from painting and music in chapter "Pattern and Rhythm" in *Aspects of the Novel*. In so doing, he clearly demonstrates the difficulty that lies in

giving definition the phenomenon's exact nature in one word, especially literature-related word. He exemplifies the pattern via Anatole France's novel *Thais* (1889) which, according to Forster, is written in "the shape of an hourglass", while Percy Lubbock's *Roman Pictures* (1923) is written as a "grand chain" (*Aspects of the Novel* 150-151), linking the fluid atmosphere of the novels to the creation of a rigid pattern. In the interrelatedness of atmosphere and pattern, something delicate – though not quite beautiful for Forster – is born he calls unity. John Beer's description of the *rhythm* is "symbolic *patterns* within the work as a whole" (15, my emphasis). Yet, this is undoubtedly another imperfect endeavour. Rigid, unmoving and not life-like, pattern is quickly found to be an inadequate name for Forster's phenomenon. Nor did Forster like, as claims Beer himself, the word 'symbol' and its implications for rhythm either. Forster writes in *Aspects* that "done badly, rhythm is most boring, it hardens into a symbol and instead of carrying us on it trips us up" (168, also quoted in Beer 15). Instead, Forster comes up with another solution; "rhythm". "Beauty is sometimes the shape of the book, the book as a whole, the unity, and our examination would be easier if it was always this. But sometimes it is not. When it is not, I shall call it rhythm", he writes (152-153). In other words, when in a novel a beauty that has nothing to do with the 'tyrannous' symmetry of the pattern is apparent, the phenomenon shall be called rhythm, argues Forster, now borrowing a term not from painting but from music.

Music was widely regarded as the most naturally harmonious of all art forms, and this was something Forster too – an ardent perfectionist – greatly appreciated. "Forster valued music because it balances spirit and structure" (Weatherhead 248). That is, again, he saw the self-evident coexistence of content and form, and loved music all the more for it. It can be seen with his explanation of the pattern that he did not hold symmetry and oneness in obvious regard if he deemed that whole artificial on the long run. He was looking for something different, and in music he seems to have found what he was looking for. As Weatherhead notices, Forster's critical essays present a number of arguments for his appreciation of music, both in itself and in relation to literature specifically (248). *Two Cheers for Democracy* (1962) is a rich collection of essays, some of

which argue for the manifold nature of music and its influence on the audience – which at times may even include writers like Forster himself who will evidently process art and beauty in a different way compared to the average mind. In "Not Listening to Music", Forster describes, seemingly ironically, his relationship with listening to music. The title makes perfect sense, however. He differentiates between two types of music, a 'music that reminds' and 'music itself', claiming that in the former case the listener does not, in fact, listen to the music per se. The reason for this is that the mind drifts off into a sea of more or less irrelevant thoughts after a relatively short period of time. Quoting his own experience, Forster demonstrates this position, writing that "I fly off every minute: after a bar or two I think how musical I am, or of something smart I might have said in a conversation; or I wonder what the composer – dead a couple of centuries – can be feeling" ("Not Listening to Music" 122). This experience is comparable to that of Margaret Schlegel in *Howards End* (1910) who, while attending a Beethoven concert, also wanders off in her mind as she is listening to the music and has multiple imaginative visions.

Besides Beethoven, Wagner was another composer with the ability to achieve such unique effect in their audience. Thinking that music would be better understood if it was linked to something tangibly perceivable, Forster immensely liked the precision and the particularity of the images Wagner's music was able to bring forth, as though "music that reminds" had a directly discernible meaning. He also experimented with colours: "I translated sounds into colours, saw the piccolo as apple-green, and the trumpets as scarlet. The arts were to be enriched by taking in one another's washing" ("Not Listening to Music" 123). He started to see that one piece of art could easily be associated with other pieces from different art forms. For instance, he liked to connect Monet with Debussy (and vice versa); or when he listened to Beethoven's *Seventh Symphony* or his *Fourth Piano Concerto*, he always had rushes of thoughts. But Forster also discovered that the lack of attention, which is very close to having these relatively random thoughts, is the Achilles heel of the "music that reminds". This is why he admittedly preferred "music itself"; he sought to listen to the sounds only, to a music "untainted' yet "never abstract" (124) since it has a message communicated

through rhythm. "There's a sense that [rhythm] is trying to push across at us something which is neither an aesthetic pattern nor a sermon. That's what I listen for specifically" (124).

Forster makes it clear that rhythm has two versions; one is the 'easier', the other the more 'difficult' type, to the extent the rhythm is easy or difficult to grasp. Both types are exemplified by Beethoven's *Fifth Symphony*. According to this theory, this piece as a whole is an example for the difficult rhythm; untappable and, according to Forster, unfound in literature, albeit he admits it is not impossible that there should be a work which contains musicality of such complexity. He cannot describe it at length; what he does say about it though is that "the opening movement, the andante, and the trio-scherzo-trio-finale-trio-finale that composes the entire block, all enter the mind at once, and extend one another into a common entity", and "the relation between the three big blocks of sound" he calls "rhythmic" (*Aspects of the Novel* 168). Meanwhile the first few notes of the symphony which virtually everybody knows represents the easy rhythm. To further the presentation of this 'easy' rhythm with the way it relates to literature, Forster brings Proust's *À la recherche du temps perdu* as an example in *Aspects of the Novel*.

1.3. Proust and the Arts

E. M. Forster was closely familiar with the work of Marcel Proust, especially with *À la recherche du temps perdu*, which becomes obvious from the many citations of and references to Proust in Forster's critical writings. Forster has mixed feelings towards the French writer's work. In his Harvard lecture entitled "The Raison d'Être of Criticism" delivered at a Symposium on Music, also published in *Two Cheers for Democracy* (1962), Forster proposes a theory of "music itself" and "music that reminds". He argues that artists who are listening to concerts start, at times, to focus not on the music itself but on what it *reminds* them of, which is a situation familiar to the readers of *À la recherche* from the famous concert scene at the end of the series (107). The ending, however, is not the only concert scene that deserves mentioning. In the first volume of *À la recherche* entitled *Un amour de Swann*, one of the narrators, Charles Swann attends a concert amidst emotional turmoil

and suddenly hears a piece of music that has already found a way to him before. Just like Forster's character Margaret in *Howards End*, Swann hears the music but does not really listen to it. It is 'music that reminds'; Swann is overwhelmed by the variety and emotional depth of the images he is induced to evoke by the music, a septet. In *Two Cheers for Democracy*, Forster writes of a Proust "sophisticated, *soigné*, *rusé*, *maladif*" while comparing him to Walt Whitman. Yet, Forster adds that "but [Proust] too listens to a septet", in which a phrase, "*la petite phrase*, has been an actor in the long-drawn inaction of the novel" (108, original emphasis). In *Aspects of the Novel*, Forster claims that *À la recherche* (or the first three volumes published in English translation by C. K. Scott Moncrieff by 1927) is "chaotic, ill-constructed, it has and will have no external shape; and yet it hangs together because it is stitched internally, because it contains rhythms" (165). Forster identifies the rhythm with Vinteuil's music; *la petite phrase* that comes back time and again, always in a distinguished role (165-166).

Music was one of the ways Proust sought to endeavour the capture of time in his novel sequence. What he did is he *de facto* centred his great literary endeavour, his *magnum opus*, *À la recherche* on the exhibition of all that fine arts have to offer to a sensitive, intelligent human being who is desperate to find answers to the greatest questions humanity has ever posed, such as, 'what is it that remains and does not decay, that is real and permanent?, 'why are we here?' and 'what is life?', and 'how to avoid death?" (albeit a symbolical, artistic death rather than a biological one though, to be sure). Proust's narrators, Charles Swann and Marcel search for "lost time" in that they are trying to find out what a human life consists of, what the things are that give meaning to our existence – especially if everything a person experiences is ever so ephemeral as the narrators perceive. Not only a form of art arguably worthwhile to discover, music is also a sensory experience with the ability to trigger the famous Proustian involuntary memory (*la mémoire involontaire*) which is, in fact, much related to the ephemeral nature of existing things. As Forster recalls in "The Raison d'Être of Criticism", the second narrator Marcel also goes to a concert at the end of *À la recherche* (108). Though he does not even look at the programme before the event, when he hears the music,

he is thrown into a trance-like state just like Marcel was. The septet is played, and Marcel finds himself in an alien world, but then comes again – the short segment of the music. Thanks to it, suddenly everything starts to make sense for the narrator:

> It is as if he has walked into an unknown region and come across the little gate which belongs to the garden of a friend. The septet expands its immensities, now comprehensible. The dawn rises crimson out of the sea, harsh midday rejoicings give way to more images, and the little phrase of the sonata, once virginal and shy, is august, quivering with colours, final, mature. (Forster, "Raison" 109).

The mentioned phrase which had such influence on both Proustian narrators, and which is often called *la petite phrase* by Proust, is part of the sonata written for the violin by Vinteuil, a fictional and (in his time) insignificant composer.

The Vinteuil sonata does not have only one meaning throughout the volumes but rather presents an impressive list of 'identities' connected through their function. The appearance of the *petite phrase* "always means emotional heightening", a climax of sorts in the structure of the novel: "character after character has listened to it, and has felt hope, jealousy, despair, peace, according to the circumstances into which *la petite phrase* has entered" (Forster, "Raison" 108). For Forster, it is music without clear place, pattern, or reference; it is 'music itself'. He writes that "the little phrase crosses the book again and again, but as an echo, a memory; we like to encounter it, but it has no binding power" (*Aspects of the Novel* 166). Forster thus perceived the connection between music and memory, the latter being a crucial theme and structure-building tool in *À la recherche*. Proust's *mémoire involontaire* is a mnemonic technique continuously used in *À la recherche* to build up the narrative without having to adhere to the linearity of time in storytelling and to evoke memories, thoughts, feelings, people of his characters' past after they have experienced a type of sensory input (a taste, smell, or something auditory, etc.). It is via the cognitive connection between the sensation and the past experience that the character experiences the rush of the *mémoire involontaire* - without a conscious effort on their part, as per definition. The Vinteuil sonata as a rhythmically appearing

trigger for involuntary memory is thus a binding force of great significance in Proust's *À la recherche du temps perdu*, and, as such, denotes a pattern-like behaviour.

In remembering, the narrators showcase the journeys of not only themselves but also of some of the people they come into contact with, ultimately helping the reader arrive to the conclusion that a life fully lived cannot possibly exclude the continuous enjoyment and celebration of the arts, be it painting, writing, or music, to only name the greatest representatives. Art gives meaning to life as it is being lived in the present and also helps life "defeat" death by enabling the immortalisation of the present via artworks. After many difficulties and disappointments, both Swann and Marcel are met with the elemental power and eternal nature of arts, especially music. As Dorothy Adelson puts it, "the quest for something in life which should be real and worth-while, something of permanent value, in short, the search for reality is ended when Marcel finds in the music of Vinteuil the supra-terrestrial, extra-temporal, eternal essence of things" (229). Forster comes to a very similar conclusion in his essay "Not Listening to Music". He writes that "[music] seems to be more real than anything, and to survive when the rest of the civilisation decays", and "the music untrammelled and untainted by reference is obviously the best sort of music to listen to; we get nearer the centre of reality" ("*NLM*" 124). To put it differently, both Proust and Forster have found in music what humanity has been searching for for a long time: immortality. With the realisation of the permanence of arts and music, time lost becomes time found (or time "regained" in Proust's words), and the real is within reach again.

2. E. M. Forster

2.1. Building a Motif System

Asked about his methods of the building patterns (understood here as leitmotivs, themes) in *The Paris Review*, Forster, after a bit of hesitation, rather eludes answering the question, looking "dubious" (Haskell and Furbank 33). But then, the following exchange occurs:

> INTERVIEWERS: (…) Well, do you like having secrets from the reader?
>
> FORSTER (*brightening*): Ah now, that's a different question. I was pleased when Peter Burra noticed that the wasp upon which Godbole meditates during the festival in *A Passage to India* had already appeared earlier in the novel.
>
> INTERVIEWERS: Had the wasp any esoteric meaning?
>
> FORSTER: Only in the sense that there is something esoteric in India about all animals. I was just putting it in; and afterwards I saw it was something that might return non-logically in the story later. (33)

This is an example of how the quoted interview displays a number of inconsistencies in the writer's answers. He claims the wasp comes back in the story "non-logically", therefore, in an unpredictable way, though half a sentence before he has connected it to a theme which would normally mean a predictability in its occurrences (certain theme may necessitate the application of a certain motif). Once the interviewers point out to him that at times there is a recurring phenomenon like the wasp in *A Passage to India*, Forster does seem to acknowledge – at least to some extent – the existence of these kind of motifs (33-34). In the same interview, the writer is also briefly asked about his relationship to music in terms of using motif systems in his novels:

> INTERVIEWER: Do you have any Wagnerian leitmotiv system to help you keep so many themes going at the same time?
>
> FORSTER: Yes, in a way, and I'm certainly interested in music and musical methods. Though I shouldn't call it a system. (Haskell and Furbank 31)

This is significant from two points of view. First (and foremost), Forster leaves no doubt as to whether he links music to the writing of novels. He acknowledges being "interested" in "musical methods", which, of course, further reinforces the question how he might have utilised such a method – for which the answer lies in his theory of the rhythm. Second, it is apparent that he does not feel comfortable looking at such methods as being an organised effort to create a system within a novel. This evokes the same problem that the previous excerpt of the interview exemplified, which is that he does not seem to want to (or be able to) look at his novels from a distanced stance. This is probably why he does not want to or cannot see the systems obviously lying at the heart of such novels of his as *A Passage to India*, where rhythm is manifested as a theme, the leitmotif of the novel, a recurring melody within the text.

There is, nonetheless, little reason to accuse Forster of being confused (or confusing). Talking at length about how unconscious he and most authors really are of the way they write their novels, he addresses the fact that despite critics and readers thinking them the most well-informed, writers are often faced with explanations of certain aspects of their novels that they never thought of, and probably never would have, on their own (34). In *Aspects of the Novel*, Forster also claims that rhythm cannot be created with conscious planning because its appearances should be built into the text when the "impulse" comes instinctually to the author (168). This means that the subconsciously, instinctually created rhythm of the novel might not even be obvious to its own writer who, without somebody else pointing it out, remains wholly or partially unaware of the significance of such a motif. The fact that it is the reader and the critic who shall apprehend the inner rhythm of the novel only heightens their role in this stance.

2.2. Reading the "Elusive" Forster

In her 1927 essay "The Novels of E. M. Forster", Virginia Woolf recognises Forster's duality as a writer and clearly demonstrates – through her usual precision and artistic imagery – a thorough understanding of the complex nature of Forster's message. Drawing on notions of "pure artists"

(for example, Jane Austen) and "preachers and teachers" (such as Charles Dickens), Woolf makes the claim that Forster possesses qualities from both categories (322). Her article argues that Forster's writing style, humour, and process of creating unique characters that instantly come alive, writes Woolf, are indicative of pure artistry, while only a teacher-writer will have such a forceful presence of message in the text as Forster. "Behind the rainbow of wit and sensibility there is a vision which he is determined that we shall see", asserts Woolf, though she adds that "his vision is of a peculiar kind and his message of an elusive nature" (322). In so doing, Beer underpins the reoccurring problem of interpreting the "elusive" Forster; a problem that comes up as regards *A Passage to India*, too.

In a recollection of Forster's personality and day-to-day life at around the age of seventy, Simon Raven addresses the oddity of the aged Forster's presence. He writes that Forster's obvious idleness – to which, as the author of the article says, he was perfectly entitled – would not be peculiar in itself. However, the fact that "he still had a very perceptive and curious mind, and professed a keen interest in all that was being done and written in the world", and, yet, he was not doing anything, made him a peculiar figure (158). In his introduction to *E. M. Forster: A Human Exploration* entitled "The Elusive Forster", John Beer provides a discussion of E. M. Forster's elusive nature while also connecting that to the evasiveness of his prose. He argues that Forster was a man "who stood 'at a slight angle to the universe'" and adds that "it made him elusive – a characteristic not only of his personal life but of his presence in the novels" (3). David Medalie calls the "misreading and missed readings" of Forster the consecutive failure to value Forster's *oeuvre* for its offered yet always overlooked depth ("Bloomsbury" 33). The cause for such misreadings is, among others, Forster's relation to elusiveness and abstraction. These concepts are connected to his wish to convey ideas and ideals set into writing in the most perfect and harmonious way possible. Perfection itself, however, is an abstraction to the human mind, and Forster's efforts to convey his thoughts in the truest sense resulted in a gap between author and receiver. Understood as a writer of little or unclear depth, Forster was rather mistakenly confined

in a literary category which can only follow behind such modernists as James Joyce or Virginia Woolf. No doubt, both Joyce and Woolf have achieved so much in the literature of the past hundred years as not many other. Notwithstanding, as David Bradshaw and Medalie point out in their respective articles in *The Cambridge Companion to E. M. Forster*, the time has come to not belittle Forster while comparing him to other writers: "veneration has made him too tame and the time is now ripe to revere him less but to listen to him all the more intently" (Medalie 45, also quoted in Bradshaw 6).

A Passage to India and its echo are discussed in similar terms of vagueness and elusiveness. About the novel, Peter Childs writes that due to "the narrative's simultaneous breadth of reference and radical indeterminacy", the novel "offers fertile ground for the broadest range of analytical and theoretical perspectives" (188). Keith Hollingsworth provides in his article a comprehensive discussion of the echo of the Marabar Caves, and in doing so, points to the difficulty that lies in defining one meaning for the echo (or echoes). He states that "they suggest strongly but are ringed with uncertainties; their power is felt but partly eludes explanation; and they seem to have more than one message, or at least to shift their import as they are met in different contexts" (210). Hollingsworth argues that the caves that host the echoes are "the secrets of matter", and the artificial openings cut by mankind are similar to the scientific discoveries of humanity in that those discoveries are also entrances to certain secrets which humans have not had access to before (216-217). The man-made entrance may also represent the many attempts of humanity at understanding natural phenomena that are simply beyond its reach. Some things are not to be understood, Forster seems to implicitly suggest, but humans are irrevocably drawn to 'forbidden' or transcendental knowledge.[1] The presentation of this idea also builds anticipation towards such an event happening in the novel, which is going to be gaining access to a mysterious, unnerving kind of knowledge via

[1] Numerous pieces of literature are based on this ancient concept, see the Genesis, *Doctor Faustus* (1592) by Christopher Marlowe, Milton's *Paradise Lost* (1667), *Faust* (1808) by Goethe, or the nineteenth-century Hungarian masterpiece, *The Tragedy of Man* by Imre Madách. *The Tragedy of Man* was translated to English in 1989 by George Szirtes who received the Déry Prize for his work.

hearing the echo. It may also be an image of the reader and the literary text, showing that attempts of the reader at understanding some phenomena within the literary work – here, perhaps self-referentially, in *A Passage to India* – may prove counterproductive and futile. However, in spite of the fact that trying to "force" the echo into a working system during an analysis may well be reductive (especially due to the rich layers of uncertainty, elusiveness, and un(der)determined meaning), it may still help in recognising and better appreciating the quality of Forster's text. As a matter of fact, looking for the rhythm in his novel helps to find the delicate musicality of the Forsterian novel.

2.3. Music and the Marabar Echo in *A Passage to India*

After his first trip to India with Goldsworthy Lowes Dickinson in 1912-1913, Forster began to write what would later become *A Passage to India*. This novel has a special significance in Forster's life and work, an *oeuvre* that consists of altogether six novels written during the first two to three decades of the twentieth century. It was the last lengthy piece of fiction he would publish in his life, though he continued to write and publish reviews, short stories, and non-fiction such as *Aspects of the Novel* for years to come. Notwithstanding the 1927 publication of *Aspects*, three years prior to *A Passage to India*'s publishing in 1924, Forster's rhythm already appeared in the novel as the echo of the Marabar Caves. The idea came from the early 1910s and 1920s when Forster travelled to India. In fact, he stayed in the country three times during his life: first, from October 1912 until April 1913; second, from March 1921 until January 1922; third, from October until December 1945.[2] During his widespread travels, he visited the Barabar Caves, the oldest rock-cut caves that still survive in India, which have found their way into the heart of the novel by displaying the famous echoes.

[2] His travels and roles related to India are comprehensively summarised by Mary Lago in her book *E. M. Forster: A Literary Life* (1995) in the chapter "The Indian Novel", as well as by Peter Childs in *The Cambridge Companion to E. M. Forster*, in the chapter entitled "A Passage to India".

The Marabar echo, similarly to the Proustian Vinteuil sonata, may be identified as Forsterian rhythm to the extent it fulfils its function as rhythm as described and identified in *Aspects of the Novel*. In spite of the fact that *Aspects* exemplifies the rhythm with the work of composers like Beethoven and Vinteuil, since it does not have to be portrayed strictly as a piece of classical music, rhythm may be employed in different ways in a novel. This idea is reinforced by Forster's obvious difficulty in finding the right term to identify it with. In *Aspects*, he first proposes to explain the nature of the rhythm via painting and call it thus 'pattern', and only after it does he say, "later we will borrow from music and call it rhythm" (149). This means that he draws on a notion associated with music to put a name to the phenomenon which is logical seeing that rhythm is perhaps the most ancient definitive feature of music as well as a crucial means of *making* music.

Hollingsworth notes that several letters are exchanged, and a good number of invitations sent and received over the course of the novel, yet the main problem seems to remain communication in the special relationships between characters (210). For instance, the most definitive appearance of the echo is when Mrs Moore and Adela visit the Marabar Caves with Aziz, and they both experience something that has to do with hearing the echo. While 'echo', "a sound repeated by reflection" according to the *Online Etymology Dictionary*, comes from the Greek *ēkhō*, a word related to *ēkhē*, meaning 'a sound'. Echoes are many times portrayed with some form of waves – another well-known image representing repetition – due to the reverberations being reflections of sound waves. The English word 'rhythm', as listed by the *Cambridge Dictionary*, is "a strong pattern of sounds, words, or musical notes that is used in music, poetry, and dancing", "a regular movement or pattern of movements", or "a regular pattern of change". *A Passage to India* is a constant, *rhythmic* crashing of phenomena; be it people, situations, and cultures, as they revolve around each other, changing and forming each time they touch. It is full of the meetings of new and old acquaintances such as the coming together of Adela Quested and Ronny Heaslop, or the meeting of Mrs Moore and Aziz. The echo thus possesses definitive qualities of the general meaning of rhythm and music such as being connected to sounds on a base level and being inherently repetitive. Forster's echo

displays the musicality of rhythm in the way it behaves throughout the novel and in the function it serves.

Forster starts to introduce the musical quality of the echo in the text by allowing the reader to get used to its rhythmic reoccurrences, first, as simply verbs. One of the two ways the notion of the echo is employed in *A Passage to India* is its abstract presence in the behaviour of Indians in difficult communicative situations. The word 'echo' is used by Forster a number of times in the novel much earlier than the scene in the Marabar Caves where the echo is already a concrete embodiment of the rhythm, not an abstraction anymore. According to Hollingsworth, the first section entitled "Mosque" contains four appearances of 'echo'. The first is when Adela and Mrs Moore both fail to communicate with Indian women at the Turtons' party (211):

> Miss Quested now had her desired opportunity; friendly Indians were before her, and she tried to make them talk, but she failed, *she strove in vain against the echoing walls of their civility*. Whatever she said produced a murmur of deprecation, varying into a murmur of concern when she dropped her pocket-handkerchief. She tried doing nothing, to see what that produced, and *they too did nothing*. (*A Passage to India* 46, my emphases)

With Adela clearly lacking the ability to establish a viable communicative situation despite her effort, this passage showcases that the echo appears immediately in the context of the 'impossibility of communication' (long before the Marabar Caves incident). Second, it also points to the fact that *forcing* interaction is not a working solution to the emerging problems communicative partners face during conversation. Adela apparently tries "to make them talk" (46) supposedly in a way she deems appropriate as a citizen of the centre of the British Empire and as her own person. Either due to not understanding or because of not *wanting* to understand (especially in the company of their own people), any Indian woman who recognises her efforts at communication, however, will either not like them or will probably overlook them. Her way is destined to fail because of her communication strategy that feeds off her position and immediately creates an unbreakable boundary between

them. Third, Indian people are not quite free to communicate in their natural way as they are put in an inherently inferior position as opposed to British-Indians. Consequently, even if the Indian person recognises and/or understands the – perhaps truly good-intentioned – communicative endeavour, they will rather opt for the safer route of simply *echoing* (mimicking) the 'superior' communicative partner. The unfortunate, albeit unavoidable consequence is that communicative acts are rendered sterile from the first moment, essentially.

In addition to this first appearance, the word 'echo' is used in "Mosque" three other times which were not counted by Hollingsworth, which is probably because the echo functions those times as a reporting word. For example, "'Thursday…' the woman *echoed*" (Forster, *A Passage to India* 47, my emphasis), "'By Jove, sir, your lady is right,' *echoed* the Eurasian" (92, m.e.), or "'Humbug, most certainly,' *echoed* the others, ashamed of themselves" (107, m.e.). Yet, as a verb, it would already fit the argument that the echo always presents itself in relation to communication, but in all three instances it is used in a situation of distress, which further reinforces the rightful place of these cases in the previously established pattern. This is a conscious build-up to the turning point of the novel, the incident at the Marabar Caves when Mrs Moore and Adela hear the echo for the first time. Up to this point, the reader has been met with a number of situations in which communication failure and the echo are sophisticatedly attached – though Forster does not overstate anything. In fact, not only does he ease the reader smoothly into the possibility of the idea that the echo and communication are related, but he also succeeds at pointing to how their occurrences happen in premeditated, rhythmic ways. From the beginning, the structure of the novel is constructed based on a phenomenon, here the echo, which contributes to the creation of rhythm in and the musicalisation of the form of the novel.

The second, more concrete use (or manifestation) of the echo becomes apparent in what is arguably its most significant appearance in *A Passage to India*, during the episode of the Marabar Caves in "Part 2" entitled "Caves". The novel foregrounds the idea that the "nature" of the place that hosts the mysterious echo is indicative of the nature of its 'resident' itself. Drawing on a

vocabulary related to rhythmic movement, Forster describes the caves as possessing an "arrangement" that "occurs again and again throughout the group of hills" (*A Passage to India* 130). This may be compared to the novel, *A Passage to India* having such an "arrangement", a rhythm, that comes forth periodically, creating a sense of musicality in the novel structure. Barbara Rosecrance also notes the language of the description whereby "the rhythmic inversions and repetitions enlarge the importance of the setting" (234). Furthermore, most visitors cannot tell whether the Marabar Caves are exciting or boring, the same or perhaps entirely different; "the pattern never varies", and yet, "nothing, nothing attaches to them" (130). This sentence draws on the notion of rhythm as discussed in *Aspects of the Novel*. Arguing for the 'ethereal', vague nature of rhythm, Forster recalls in *Aspects* Proust's "little phrase" which "crosses the book again and again, but *as an echo*, a memory; we like to encounter it, but it has not binding power" (166, my emphasis). In other words, the idea of the caves, and inside it the echo, can be seen but can only hardly be grasped via the average cognitive and linguistic abilities of a human being.

Yet, again, if they are interpreted in light of their own effect – which is the creation of a musical structure –, they may be understood with more success. The way the echo is described in the novel evokes musical and rhythmic notions. The echo is described as a "terrifying" and "monotonous noise" which may be produced by anything from concrete to abstract, "hope, politeness, the blowing of a nose, the squeak of a book, all produce "boum" (*A Passage to India* 153). It is also likened to snakes moving around: "if several people talk at once, an overlapping howling noise begins, echoes generate echoes, and the cave is stuffed with a snake composed of small snakes, which writhe independently". This reinforces the smothering nature of the echo quite visually, and simultaneously alludes to a movement that reminds the reader of dancing, evoking both rhythm and music (153). The now embodied echo (as opposed to the 'echo' as a verb) follows a pattern of appearing when communication fails and/or the action of the novel is at a (more or less significant) culmination point, creating a sense of rhythmically waving novel structure. In this crucial scene of meeting the echo for the first time in the caves, there is a cause-and-effect

relationship between communication failure and the culmination of the action, which is how Forster starts to build up the tension from the instances of miscommunication in order for the arrival of rhythm (echo) to be well-established dramaturgically. For instance, when Mrs Moore hears the echo, she does not alert anybody for fear of embarrassing Aziz in his moment of shining. But this is exactly why when she does break down, it feels powerful; the reader gets to appreciate the weight of her realisations crushing down on her. The rhythmic sound of "ou-boum", the echo, simply exorcises all the life energy that was left inside of her, succeeding at making her devoid of love (Hollingsworth 212). Yet, the echo cannot be blamed for it all. Mrs Moore gives in to a desperation that has already been there in her mind and soul; the echo cannot put these thoughts there, but it can give them power. Thus, the rhythm as manifested in the echo comes at a crucial scene of change of character for her.

Adela, in the meantime, experiences something similar to what Mrs Moore's has gone through. The appearance of the echo shows that she has also reached a point in her character arc where something is about to change drastically. As Adela and Aziz walk the caves, Adela realises that "she and Ronny – no, they did not love each other" (158) – this is a thought she had never dared to entertain before. The fact that Adela becomes aware of the lack of love on both her and Ronny's part is another example of a failing communication between characters. It seems she was not self-aware enough in the past to admit her lack of feelings for Ronny to him as well as to herself. Such bottling up of emotions and the lack of communication between all parties end up in a great tragedy for everyone involved. Adela, after hearing the echo and becoming aware of her reality, accuses Aziz of molesting her but later becomes unsure as to what happened in the cave. The failed communication between Ronny and Adela shows itself again as Ronny displays an incapability and unwillingness to take her seriously in the face of the business of the magistrate (which is adamant on sentencing Aziz). During this conversation between Ronny, Mrs Moore, and Adela, the echo also comes up:

"(…) but there is this echo I keep on hearing."

"Oh, what of the echo?" asked Mrs. Moore, paying attention to her for the first time.

"I can't get rid of it."

"I don't suppose you ever will." (206-207)

The resurfacing of the echo for Adela as well as Mrs Moore shows that a change has been started in the caves, and the emblem as well as trigger of change has not gone away. Mrs Moore is now vocal about having had enough of taking care of everyone around her; she has become completely disillusioned. As to Adela, she keeps hearing the echo, which in fact makes frequent appearances throughout the rest of the novel, reminding the reader, and Adela especially, of the revelation she had. Though it confuses and traumatises her, its presence helps her realise more and more of the truth of what happened during her trip, finally helping her to confess during the trial scene that Aziz is innocent. With this, she breaks the spell of constant failures in communication and remains true to her new-found self-awareness. Adela and Aziz are both free; Aziz is acquitted of all charges. At the end, only the echo, now in the image of a "beautifully naked god", remains in the court room, "rhythmically to agitate the clouds of descending dust", reminding the reader one more time of the ethereal nature of the echo as the rhythm of *A Passage to India*, putting the final musical note at the end of the novel (238).

3. Virginia Woolf

3.1. Music and Musicality in Woolf's Life

The way Woolf has succeeded at utilising music in her various novels is compatible with the innovative ideas of the nineteenth century as regards art. Writers of the early twentieth century turned towards the findings of new fields of science and the humanities, and also towards innovative writing techniques that were exciting mixtures of some of the greatest art forms. This is how music and musicality came to have such an integral part in the forming narratives. Virginia Woolf was no exception, although she definitely did not decide to build music into her works because it was what others did, but because she had a clear affinity for music herself from a very young age, and that inspired her throughout her life to include music into her work. She turned to music in order to make it possible for the reader to get closer to her "artistic vision" (Crapoulet qtd. in Sutton 15). She also, perhaps unconsciously, internalised the Paterian idea that music is a superior art form for which all other forms strive; that music is the art form that can communicate when all else fails, especially words. Emma Sutton claims that in an effort to musicalize her novel *Voyage Out* (1915), Woolf

> drew on and critiqued two of the most important formal innovations of late nineteenth-century music – namely the leitmotiv (a melodic, harmonic or rhythmic unit commonly assigned to particular characters or ideas in the dramas) and the *Gesamtkunstwerk* (the union of music, words, dance and gesture into one 'total artwork'). (27)

In other words, in her debut novel already, Woolf is seen to have placed great importance on the appearance of the rhythm as a leitmotiv and on the creation of such piece of art in which the different art forms communicate with each other. She managed to merge arts into a form of totality, producing meaning of such depth and complexity that would never have come to life had she not introduced music into the narrative.

Woolf is known today as a female writer who frequently and articulately problematised the situation of women both historically and in her contemporary socio-political setting, often comparing the two as she does in the previously mentioned "Mr Bennet and Mrs Brown" with the now famous fictitious sister of Shakespeare, or in *A Room of One's Own* (1929). The Stephen family home was often filled with music. Some of the eminent guests at the Stephens were celebrated musicians, a good example for which is British composer and Royal College of Music director Sir Hubert Parry. The family also owned a piano as well as a pianola (though the latter, Leslie Stephen did not enjoy much), and "live and mechanical music was this a routine part of Woolf's childhood domestic life" (Sutton, *Classical Music* 5). Singing, dancing, and painting were taught to Woolf as to any young gentlewoman from an educated, upper-class household, wishing to obtain the 'accomplishments' proper to her class, which is why she was highly aware of the many discriminatory differences in the education provided for girls and boys. In a 1920 series of letters entitled "The Intellectual Status of Women", Woolf responded to Desmond MacCarthy reviewing Arnold Bennett's (many times) misogynistic collection of essays entitled *Our Women: Chapters on the Sex-Discord.* Bennett claims an intellectual inequality between men and women in his essays which Woolf strictly condemns. Raising the issue of gender-isolated (or single-sex) musical education, she points to one of the foremost reasons for the lack of women's societal and intellectual emancipation. A system which enables (and encourages) a curriculum that provides different materials for young boys and girls clearly cannot be based on intellectual ability but rather on a traditional, conservative concept of gendered abilities and skills, perpetuating the status quo of the female and the male in society (Sánchez Cuervo 275-6).

Woolf never really showed special aptitude towards singing or playing instruments; she was not a composer, nor a professional player. As Quentin Bell writes in his 1972 Virginia Woolf biography,

> She was not, in any strict sense, musical. She played no instrument; I do not think that she could follow a score with any deep comprehension. Music, it is true,

> delighted her; she enjoyed the family pianola (when Adrian did not play it for too long), as she was later to enjoy the gramophone; it formed a background to her musings, a theme for her pen (…). (149)

Though not a musical person, in several of her letters (362, 443, 484, 505) Virginia reports to have frequented concerts; she even writes in letter 443 to Saxon Sydney-Turner that she is "pining for music" (362). This would seem contradictory to her lack of musicality; nonetheless, actively making music (singing, playing an instrument, etc.) is quite different from passively enjoying it. Her joy in and understanding of music probably increased many times over thanks to the influence of her husband, Leonard Woolf who was not only an amateur composer of notable musical skill but also a "fanatical concert and opera-goer who regularly made the pilgrimage to Bayreuth and could tell you who sang what part in which opera ever since Bayreuth began" (Bell 101). The Woolfs later visited Bayreuth together where they, for instance, saw operas of Richard Wagner. Virginia's article "Impressions at Bayreuth" (1909) criticises Wagner's opera, *Parsifal* (1882) she saw at Bayreuth, as a matter of fact.

Even though the scope of this thesis does not include an in-depth analysis of Woolf and Wagner, a short mentioning does seem reasonable because the topic is relatively well-covered in the research concerning the role of music in Woolf's *oeuvre*. In her 2013 book entitled *Virginia Woolf and Classical Music*, Emma Sutton provides a comprehensive discussion of the relationship between classical music and Virginia Woolf, focusing especially on the Wagnerian influence on Woolf's novels. Arguing that both literature and the opera may be considered a "partnership between words and music", Sutton demonstrates her understanding of *Voyage Out* as a literary dialogue between the traditions of the opera and literature (26). Sutton establishes a connection between Woolf's novel and Wagner's *Tristan und Isolde* (1865), claiming that Woolf simultaneously criticises the Wagnerian opera and to a large extent draws on it (26). *Tristan und Isolde*, nonetheless, is not the only Wagnerian piece that Woolf took as inspiration for her writing. Katherine O'Callaghan's edited volume, *Essays on Music and Language in Modernist Literature* (2018) includes two articles that treat the

relationship between Wagner and Woolf. Sutton's article, "Woolf Rewriting Wagner: *The Waves* and *Der Ring des Nibelungen*" discusses Woolf's *The Waves* and Wagner's *Ring* cycle (1876), foregrounding Woolf's at times ironic but also complex attitude towards the two most definitive mythopoeic works by Richard Wagner, *Parsifal* and especially the *Ring*. These operas explore such myths as the fall of the gods and the legend of the Holy Grail (Sutton 18). Jamie McGregor's contribution to the O'Callaghan's volume, "*The Ring*, *The Waves*, and the *Wake*: Eternal Recurrence in Wagner, Woolf, and Joyce" analyses *The Waves* and the *Ring* in combination with James Joyce's *Finnegans Wake* (1939). McGregor, in an effort to produce a joint analysis of Wagner, Woolf, and Joyce, points out in his article that the "cyclical form and theme" in Wagner's *Ring* has left an obvious mark on the works of "the two greatest exponents of high modernist English prose", both Virginia Woolf and James Joyce (48).

3.2. A Musical Rethinking of the Novel Form: Woolf and Joyce

The inclusion of Wagner into literary works is not the only way to "musicalize" the novel. Aldous Huxley called the building of music into literary pieces the "musicalization of fiction" in his book *Point Counterpoint* in which he takes into consideration that music may serve as content ("meditate on Beethoven") or an organising force of structure ("changes of moods, the abrupt transitions") (202). He recognises the power of music when building a theme not only in musical but also literary pieces. He claims that you "get [the little waltz tune] into the novel" by transition, alternation, modulation, and variation (203). He also sees the power that lies in authorial intentions, but he focuses on the author's freedom to modulate from one ("emotional, scientific, economic, religious, metaphysical") aspect of a narrative to the other, and he does not focus on how music can create structure by a form of rhythm with a premeditated significance theorised by E. M. Forster in *Aspects of the Novel*, used by Forster as well as Woolf.

Many of Woolf's works are considered highly musical in terms of not only content (music as a topic in the novel) but also form (music as an organising force in the structure of the novel).

The much-celebrated formal innovation in her novels came to be affected a great deal by her close connection with music and by her unique perception of what it meant for her as translated into words, which made its application to the process of rethinking the narrative structure of novels all the more inevitable. Sutton also articulates this idea by saying, "many of her formal innovations in narrative perspective, structure and form are indebted to musical techniques and genres" (*Classical Music* 15), and Emilie Crapoulet reinforces this thought when she identifies music as "undoubtedly the basis for some of her many literary innovations" (qtd. in Sutton 15). Although Woolf definitely did write *about* music (see, for instance, *Voyage Out*'s many references to music as well as its protagonist, a talented female pianist; the instances of musical events in *The Years*, and so on), Woolf's innovative power lies in the unique rethinking of the novel form. This can also be seen in the fact Woolf was, without a doubt, a heraldic voice in the creation of new authorial stances, voices, points of view in literature. She was one of the authors next to Dorothy Richardson and James Joyce who perfected the use of the internal monologue and the stream of consciousness technique. Woolf was also acutely aware of the limited nature of expression via language, even if such innovative, subjective techniques of narration were used to communicate meaning as the stream of consciousness.

From quite early on, her writings have a connection to music to a varying extent, whether it be her first novel *Voyage Out* (1915), later *Mrs Dalloway* (1925), *To the Lighthouse* (1927), or *The Waves* (1931). Sutton quotes Forster saying of *To the Lighthouse* that it is 'a novel in sonata form' (16). The literary nature of the sonata is extensively explained by Scott J. Ordway as it relates to James Joyce's "Sirens" episode of his magnum opus, *Ulysses* (1922). Ordway explores in his article which musical genre is the most accurately descriptive of "Sirens". He argues that the episode taking on the musical form "fuga per canonem" (that is, fugue), a claim made by Stuart Gilbert in his 1930 book entitled *James Joyce's Ulysses*, is wrong because "[the fugue] establishes expectations that literature cannot meet" (87). As per the *Encyclopaedia Britannica*, the fugue is "a compositional procedure characterized by the systematic imitation of a principal theme (called the subject) in

simultaneously sounding melodic lines (counterpoint)". The most crucial characteristics of the fugue relate first and foremost to music, not to literature. The overlapping of voices is metaphorical in most cases of literature because it is not as resoluble to construe such a structure in novels as in the musical genre fugue (Levin as qtd in Ordway 86).

Since some form of music is arguably there in "Sirens", Ordway proposes that the solution be the sonata which he calls "the most 'literary' of all musical structures" (87). Vivaldi already wrote sonatas, but the form's true emergence into limelight came with the Classical composers Haydn and Beethoven, and with Romantics like Chopin, Mendelssohn, Liszt, and Brahms, who all inspired a great number of young composers to not lose sight of the beauty and worth of the sonata form. According to Ordway, the sonata is "not defined by polyphonic processes at all but rather by a sense of musical narrative and development" (87). Like in fugues, leitmotifs can be found in sonatas, but instead of overlapping, they interact as individual themes. Sonatas also contain tension, resolution, and dramatization in the same manner as pieces of literary fiction. For these reasons, the sonata is perfect to be used in the building of the structure of a novel like *Ulysses* (87). Proust's reoccurring Vinteuil sonata, significant for its role as rhythm in *À la recherche* as established by Forster in *Aspects of the Novel* (166), is also a sonata in terms of its form. In addition, sonatas are generally composed of three parts, the exposition, the development, and the recapitulation. Although the triadic structure of *To the Lighthouse* by Woolf could also invite the thesis-antithesis-synthesis interpretation, Wei Ding and Lixia Jia explain in their article that *To the Lighthouse* with its three parts, "The Window", "Time Passes", and "The Lighthouse" is based on the form of the sonata (16). *To the Lighthouse*, published three years after *A Passage to India*, echoes the three-part structure ("Mosque", "Caves, and "Temple") of Forster's "Indian novel" in this regard, which reinforces the sense of musicality in both novels.

In Woolf's perhaps most elusive work, *The Waves*, music steps in as a new means of communication – just like in Forster's *A Passage to India* – in situations where language would otherwise fail to deliver the message from the part of both author and character, though it is not

the first novel in which she had experimented new ways of building music into the novel. In *Voyage Out*, for instance, this can be seen via "Tristan's representation of language's limited communicative capacity and the opera's corresponding valorisation of musical expressivity" (Sutton 27). That is, language and music stand in juxtaposition, emphasising the communicative ability of music when all else (language especially) fails. *The Waves* also showcases the internal monologue in a way that is difficult to 'follow' in the traditional sense since the reader cannot expect a direct message transmitted the way novels had done before modernism. Characters speaking in *The Waves* are so enclosed within and into their own minds that in the lack of a wholly coherent plot it is only language that 'happens', and at times it could still very well fail to communicate. This is the reason why musicality, rhythms play such a significant role in *The Waves* – they help the reader make sense of the mountains of words that are flowing "in waves" towards them.

3.3. The Musicalisation of *Mrs Dalloway*

Another novel by Virginia Woolf which have so far eluded such 'musical' scrutiny is *Mrs Dalloway*. The surfacing of such musical themes is indicative of the perceivable presence of a strong rhythm within the novel, building its structure appearance by appearance, bringing a new aspect of the musicality of Woolf's novel to the forefront. Musicality and rhythm are some of the most definitive features of poetry next to the display of a wide range or a great depth of personal emotion. In her essay in *The Cambridge Companion to Virginia Woolf*, Jane Goldman discusses at length the poetic nature of Woolf's *oeuvre*, focusing especially on the poetics of her later novels beginning with *Mrs Dalloway*, later *To the Lighthouse*, *Orlando: A Biography*, and *The Waves*. Goldman makes the claim that Woolf was completely aware the increasingly poetic nature of her novels and connects this to her changing moods. Goldman associates "the expression of an intensely subjective emotion or spirituality" in Woolf's prose (49) with "the spontaneous overflow of powerful feelings", the most frequently quoted statement from Wordsworth's "Preface" to the Romantic manifesto *Lyrical Ballads* (Wordsworth and Coleridge 237). Evoking the key idea of Romantic poetry, Woolf, claims

Goldman, stands on the opposite side of Joyce who famously rejected the Romantic focus on emotions in poetry, as written up in his 1919 ars poetica, "Tradition and the Individual Talent". Were Woolf a poet, her focus on emotion would probably have been generally considered outdated, but – alas – she was a prose writer which, in turn, made her move all the more refreshing and innovative (Goldman 50).

The poetic, or musical, nature of Woolf's text is also apparent in the rhythm that is constructed wave by wave throughout the novel, behaving according to the description of rhythm theorised by E. M. Forster in *Aspects of the Novel* in 1927, appearing also in Proust's *À la recherche*. Marcel Proust and E. M. Forster's strong literary connection has already been shown in the earlier sections of this thesis. Nonetheless, it is not only Forster who was deeply influenced by the famous French writer but all members of the Bloomsbury Group, of which Woolf was a core member. They "plunged into the Proustian text" which ensured the "enduring impact on the work, reading, and lives of the Bloomsbury" (Caws and Wright 11). Though her French was not very strong, she read the first few volumes in the original language – she did find it a challenge but endured, and finally came to admire Proust very much (Caws and Wright 12). In "Poetry, Fiction and the Future" (1927, same year as *To the Lighthouse*), she even says of the general writer that

> he will have extended the scope of his interest so as to dramatize some of those influences which play so large a part in life, yet have so far escaped the novelist – the power of music, the stimulus of sight, the effect on us of the shape of trees or the play of colour. (149)

If anything, this is a nod towards the influence of Marcel Proust who introduced English modernist writers to the impactful world of sensory experiences – which leads to the inner psyche of human beings, covering present and past, all topics that peaked Woolf's interest. In *Mrs Dalloway*, the psychological state and treatment of Septimus Warren Smith exemplifies how such a patient would be treated in the years that followed World War II. Woolf also made sure to signal the presence

(and passing) of time in a very exact manner by the rhythmic mentioning of the Big Ben and the hour it has struck.

One of the most paramount aspects of Forster's rhythm is that it gives the novel a sense of structure. The appearance of the rhythm – manifested as the Vinteuil sonata in *À la recherche*, the echo of the Marabar Caves in *A Passage to India*, and the striking of clocks (most often the Big Ben) in *Mrs Dalloway* – serves as an indication of the fact that a major event is happening (or is about to happen) from the viewpoint of the whole novel at that time when the rhythm comes forth. It appears because a character experiences something, perhaps a key change is about to take place in the general plot, or there is a shift of viewpoints, etc. – in short, an event of such predominance comes to pass which the reader should definitely notice. Goldman argues that certain themes (sounds, sights, etc.) such as a backfiring car, a plane in the sky, a person singing while selling flowers, or the sound of the bells of Big Ben are "points of transition between consciousnesses" (57). In other words, now focusing on the Big Ben, whenever it strikes, there is a shift or a change in the text; it definitely signals that something crucial has happened or is happening while the clock is striking.

In *Mrs Dalloway*, the striking clock becomes a signifier of the appearing rhythm. For example, in the very beginning of the novel, the reader follows Clarissa's stream of consciousness. "One feels in the midst of the traffic, or waking at night, Clarissa was positive, a particular hush, or solemnity; an indescribable pause; a suspense (…) before Big Ben strikes. There! Out it boomed. First a warning, musical; then the hour, irrevocable (*Mrs Dalloway* 67). This passage shows the significance of Big Ben since it appears already in the first one or two pages of the novel. The striking is preceded by a suspense; then the clock strikes two, the first being only a cautionary stroke which Woolf describes as "musical", thus its association with rhythm is made quite clear. The second strike, however, is not playful anymore as music or general rhythms are imagined to be. It is serious and "irrevocable" – the shift has gone forth, and the striking clock ruthlessly takes forward the characters, the plot, as well as the reader into the next set of events. Even the sentence

structure echoes the rhythmic ticking of the clock before the striking of the hour with the semicolons separating short propositions. Not only that but the actual striking is also translated into words. After the period of suspense that foreshadows the more violent sounding of the hour, the Big Ben starts to sing, loud and clear, that the hour has come. "There! Out it boomed" (67), writes Woolf, mirroring the nature of the two strokes, the first being to shorter one with the role to call our attention, and the second as the one which completes the act.

It is possible to perceive rhythm in how one transitioning period is also constructed of rhythmic shifts, producing a change as the end result. "The car came on. Suddenly Mrs Coates looked up into the sky. The sound of an aeroplane bored ominously into the ears of the crowd" (83). In this next incident of the clock striking, all becomes centred around another transition, preceded by multiple auditory and visual sensations. In fact, mere seconds before the hour, the plane had been writing letters into the sky that the onlookers were trying to figure out. As they were gazing up, it seemed as if the world fell completely still again before the next shock, just like in the previous case, but also mirroring the initial silence of the Marabar caves. Woolf's text emphasises, "sounds are made harmonies with premeditation; the spaces between them were as significant as the sounds" (85). That is, sound and sight work together in these moments only for silence to set in during the next few seconds, so that the stroke is felt with even more weight by characters as much as the reader. These moments are truly those of a brief transitioning period, also signalled and made smoother by the interposition of a few minor characters' points of view. First, it was actually Clarissa's consciousness that the reader could follow, but it is worthwhile to notice that in the seconds leading up to the hour, the reader does not hear Clarissa's perceptions or see through her eyes anymore:

> The Prince lived at St James's; but he might come along in the morning to visit his mother. So Sarah Bletchley said with her aby in her arms, tipping her foot up and down as though she were by her own fender in Pimlico, but keeping her eyes on

the Mall, while Emily Coates ranged over the palace windows and thought of the housemaids (…).” (83)

During these moments, the focal points are some of the named members of the crowd. Sarah Bletchley and Mrs Emily Coates appear only fleetingly, though due to hearing their thoughts and some of their words, they get a personality (even if not too detailed). Woolf writes then, “in this extraordinary silence and peace, in this pallor, in this purity, bells struck eleven times” (84). The structure of the individual propositions within the sentence again works as if they were mirroring the strokes of the clock. Finally, after 11 o’clock, it is Lucrezia and Septimus, a young married couple through whose eyes and minds the reader gets to go on with the discovery of the story. This is how a rhythmic change is built up not only in terms of the structure of the whole novel but also within a single transition and a single sentence, creating a strong musicality of text.

Yet, change does not happen only in terms of characters, viewpoints, or key events; time also experiences a shift around the time the rhythm is active. In fact, *Mrs Dalloway*’s rhythm serves as an indication of the presence, the passing, and the occasional Proustian back-shifting of time. The clock itself is a well-known symbol of time (not accidentally), and the mechanism of the clock is a rhythmic signal because its nature as a form of rhythm is unchanging, unmoving. Yet, the mechanism is also quite literally a form of movement since, for instance, parts of the clock itself move incessantly thus mirroring time’s capability of movement. Time in this novel does not move only forwards though, as one would naturally believe, but also backwards. The objectively perceived forward-moving time is many times referred to in *Mrs Dalloway* as a means to communicate the anxiety over the aging of Clarissa and Peter Walsh especially, making decisions and related regrets feel heavier and heavier. There are numerous occasions when the strokes of Big Ben or church bells signal the time; or when the exact age of Clarissa and Peter, both above fifty, is mentioned showing the process as they try to convince themselves that they are still young and still have much before them. For instance, as regards Clarissa, “She had just broken into her fifty-

second year. Months and months of it were still untouched", or when Peter thinks, "For he was not old; his life was not over; not by any means. He was only just past fifty" (98, 105).

A feature the rhythm has shown so far is its relationship to the opposition between sound and silence. The rhythm often needs a 'bed of silence', an opposition of the "sound" of the rhythm, that has already been mentioned in order, or as a way, to prepare its forthcoming. For example, in *A Passage to India*, there was mostly silence between the travellers as they walked out and about the Marabar Caves, perhaps one or two superficial exchanges, but the real processes had already started in the minds of the characters, unspoken. Similarly, in *Mrs Dalloway* there is miscommunication as well as a lack of expression of certain thoughts or realities in such instances of the rhythm. When the clock strikes again, it is the culminating point of the scene that presents the reunion of Clarissa and Peter. Clarissa and Peter are still too emotionally involved in each other, which is the reason why there is an easily perceivable communicative paralysis between the two of them they struggle to overcome. The words that do get expressed move on an extremely wide scale though. Questions and answers are conspicuously brief and awkwardly to the point, pregnant with silences and thoughts held back, but some of their thoughts and feelings seem to almost 'erupt'. See, for instance, the following excerpt of their conversation (Clarissa asks, Peter answers):

> 'But it's so extraordinary that you should have come this morning!' (…) 'Do you remember (…) how the blinds used to flap at Bourton?'
>
> 'They did' (…) "I often wish I'd gotten on better with your father'. (*Mrs Dalloway* 103)

Clarissa's exclamation is completely surface-level and formal, one that is usually used to fill in an awkward silence or to give time to the speaker to think. On the contrary, the question she asks immediately after is a more or less unexpected call for bringing up memories. Her logic there is also understandable because the past means an immediate break from the awkward disconnectedness they experience in their talk about their present situations. However, instead of ending up with a conversation topic that is easier to navigate, it reinforces the growing tension

between them. Even though they do say things out loud too, these remarks remain rather shallow compared to what is going on inside their head[3]. They manage to escape the discomfort of having to directly articulate their pain, yet this is exactly how they prolong their own and each other's suffering, thus paralysing themselves further.

The rhythm often appears at a culminating point of a conversation, that is, when it is about to reveal something hidden or as of yet unspoken between significant characters[4]. This is also true for the scene of Clarissa and Peter's reunion in *Mrs Dalloway*. When Peter blurts out the sentence "I am in love" to Clarissa's question "Well, and what's happened to you?", the tension only gets greater because is not at all obvious at this point who he had just professed to be in love with, Clarissa or someone else, both being something she wants and dreads simultaneously (106, 105). At this point, the dramaturgical arc has been set for the rhythm to finally intervene in this emotionally loaded exchange of actions and words is indicated by the pressure only continuing to increase until it simply cannot grow any greater. When the tension is at its most unbearable, the door suddenly opens, and Clarissa's daughter comes in whom Clarissa introduces, "Here is my Elizabeth", and *then* it finally strikes half-past, ending the scene almost effective immediately as Peter rushes out of the Dalloway home moments after the introduction (109).

The last definitive feature that can be pointed out as common in the works of Forster, Proust, and Woolf is the rhythm's relationship to time. As it has been pointed out, many of the appearances of the rhythm seem to be closely related to key points in the novels structurally. This way, the rhythm can alert readers that the story has come to a point (again) where something significant is about to happen. As seen in *A Passage to India* as well as *Mrs Dalloway*, most of these major occasions of change involve the protagonists (or some of the characters most in the

[3] This is how the stream of consciousness succeeds at bringing the reader within the story, within the minds of characters; the reader still gets to "hear" them, which makes following the conversation that much easier – though if just those utterances were taken into consideration which are actually said out loud, the discussion would not make as much sense to an outsider.
[4] See the revelations of Swann at the concert where he hears the Vinteuil sonata, or those of Adela or Mrs Moore as they hear the echo.

foreground story-wise). It is also logical that the shift takes place because their thinking has been irreversibly changed due to an impact; or there has been a mental battle going on inside their psyche which produces a revelation. These thoughts, in turn, are usually about the past: past actions, decisions, more or less distant from the present. In *A Passage to India*, the revelation of Adela Quested can be seen as explained, while at the half-past-eleven stroke in *Mrs Dalloway* – which scene has been used as representative of the workings of the rhythm in Woolf's novel so far as well – what happens is that Clarissa starts to voluntarily evoke the past in an effort to gain control of the present situation. What she does not count on is that reviving those moments of special closeness between the two stirs up the situation that is already overwhelming enough. "'Do you remember the lake?' she said, in an abrupt voice, under the pressure of an emotion which caught her heart, made the muscles of her throat stiff, and contracted her lips in a spasm as she said 'lake'" (*Mrs Dalloway* 104). In this short excerpt, it becomes obvious that saying the word 'lake' out loud is what had the greatest effect on Clarissa – even though it was she herself who initiated the remembering. It is as if she did not think it would take her right back to the place and feeling that have been attached to 'lake' for years, as if she would not have believed she is still emotionally attached to this segment of the past. This moment is also interesting because it shows a direct link to the way Proust's involuntary memory works in *À la recherche du temps perdu*. Clarissa pronounces the word 'lake' which her entire body senses, overreacting. Then:

> For she was a child throwing bread to the ducks, between her parents, and at the same time a grown woman coming to her parents who stood by the lake, holding her life in her arms which, as she neared them, grew larger and larger in her arms, until it became a whole life, a complete life, which she put down by them and said, 'This is what I have made of it! This!' And what had she made of it? What indeed? (104)

This scene shows great similarity to the one in *A Passage to India* where Adela comes to the realisation that she does not love Ronny, the one she is supposed to marry. Clarissa also remembers,

but this is significant not because of the act itself but because of what it shows her. It shows her what she has given up on, what she lost due to that decision, and what she has made of her life instead. The memory literally makes her remember not only her past but her present also; it reminds her of who she was, who she is, and who she could have been. This also explains her 'extreme' behaviour with Peter when she kisses him. It is almost as if it was not, or not just Peter who she kissed but, on the one hand, who Peter could have been (for her, with her), and who she herself could have been (for Peter, with Peter). She literally embraces her would-have-been self, a perhaps more authentic self. Woolf concludes by having Clarissa thinking, "It was all over for her". Peter also senses this change in her; it is no coincidence when he asks her whether she is happy with Richard or not. But this process is cut painfully short with the striking clock closing the scene, reinforcing the rhythm's power to start as well as end the most significant scenes in a novel.

Conclusion

The aim of this thesis was to highlight the significant relationship music had with the twentieth-century English literary modernism. Some of the greatest writers of this age use music and rhythm as organising forces, leitmotifs, in the structuring of their novels, creating a special sense of musicality in their texts. In his major work of literary criticism, *Aspects of the Novel* (1927), Forster presents a so-called "rhythm", a specific type of musicality appearing in prose, suggesting that there exists a type of rhythm which is more difficult to perceive and another which is easily observable. The easier type of rhythm is a (musical) note whose reappearances give structure to a writing. This rhythm shapes the structure of the novel by the coming forth of its perceivable representation in the right place dramaturgically and structure-wise, as exemplified by Marcel Proust's "Vinteuil sonata" from *In Search of Lost Time* (1913-1927). As this thesis has shown, Forster himself uses this technique in his last major novel, *A Passage to India* (1924) whereby he portrays the rhythm as the echoes of the Marabar Caves, a mysterious phenomenon in the novel. Similarly to Forster, Virginia Woolf was interested in music in terms of creative writing as well as criticism. Keen on rethinking the novel form, she became heavily invested in the exploration of the relationship between music and literature, which can, in fact, be seen in the innovative nature of her prose. Many of Woolf's novels have been thoroughly analysed in terms of their relationship to music or musicality. For instance, the structure of *To the Lighthouse* has been compared to the sonata form (Sutton 16, Weing and Jia 16) in which regard it is comparable to the "Sirens" episode of James Joyce's modernist *magnum opus*, *Ulysses*. *Mrs Dalloway*, however, has so far succeeded at eluding a close musical examination that also disregards Richard Wagner. That is why this thesis has taken it upon itself to show, at least in part, the music that can be 'heard' in *Mrs Dalloway*. This thesis has argued that Forster's theory of rhythm is shown in practice in Woolf's novel via the reoccurring theme of the striking clock (or bell) which, much like the echoes of the Marabar Caves in *A Passage to India*, contributes to the musicalization of *Mrs Dalloway*.

WORKS CITED

Adelson, Dorothy. "The Vinteuil Sonata." *Music & Letters*, vol. 23, no. 3, Oxford UP, 1942, pp. 228–33.

Beer, John. "Introduction: The Elusive Forster." *E. M. Forster: A Human Exploration*, edited by G. K. Das and John Beer, Palgrave Macmillan, 1979, pp. 1-11.

Bell, Quentin. *Virginia Woolf: A Biography*. Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1972.

Bojti, Zsolt. *Wilde, Stenbock, Prime-Stevenson: Homophilia and Hungarophilia in Fin-de-Siècle Literature*. 2022. Eötvös Loránd University, PhD Dissertation.

Bradshaw, David. "Introduction." *The Cambridge Companion to E. M. Forster*, edited by David Bradshaw, Cambridge UP, 2007, pp. 1-7.

Caws, Mary Ann, and Sarah Bird Wright. *Bloomsbury and France: Art and Friends*. Oxford UP, 2000.

Childs, Peter. "A Passage to India". *The Cambridge Companion to E. M. Forster*, edited by David Bradshaw, Cambridge UP, 2007, pp. 188-208.

Deutsch, David. *British Literature and Classical Music: Cultural Contexts 1870-1945*. Bloomsbury Academic, 2015.

Ding, Wei, and Lixia Jia. "The Unity of *To the Lighthouse* Achieved by Sonata Form." *Advances in Literary Study*, vol. 4, 2016, pp. 16-21.

Forster, Edward Morgan. *A Passage to India*. RosettaBooks, 2002.

———. *Aspects of the Novel*. Harcourt, Inc. 1985.

———. *Howards End*. Dover Publications, 2002.

———. "Not Listening to Music". *Two Cheers for Democracy*, Mariner Books, 1962, pp. 122-125.

———. “The Raison d’Être of Criticism”. *Two Cheers for Democracy*, Mariner Books, 1962, pp. 105-118.

Haskell, F. J. H., and P. N. Furbank. “E. M. Forster.” *The Paris Review Interviews 1*, edited by Malcolm Cowley, Penguin Books, 1958, pp. 25-35.

Hollingsworth, Keith. “‘A Passage to India’: The Echoes in the Marabar Caves.” *Criticism*, vol. 4, no. 3, Wayne State UP, 1962, pp. 210–24.

Huxley, Aldous. *Point Counterpoint*. Routledge, 2008.

Lago, Mary. *E. M. Forster: A Literary Life*. Palgrave Macmillan, 1995.

Langland, Elizabeth. “Forster and the Novel.” *The Cambridge Companion to E. M. Forster*, edited by David Bradshaw, Cambridge UP, 2007, pp. 92-103.

Macaulay, Rose. “Women in the East.” *Daily News*, 4 June 1924. Rpt. in *E. M. Forster (Critical Heritage)*, edited by Philip Gardner, Routledge, 1997, pp. 196-198.

Medalie, David. “Bloomsbury and Other Values.” *The Cambridge Companion to E. M. Forster*, edited by David Bradshaw, Cambridge UP, 2007, pp. 32-46.

Medalie, David. *E. M. Forster’s Modernism*. Palgrave Macmillan, 2002.

O’Callaghan, Katherine. “Introduction.” *Essays on Music and Language in Modernist Literature: Musical Modernism*, edited by Katherine O’Callaghan, Routledge, 2018, pp. 1-16.

Ordway, Scott J. “A Dominant Boylan: Music, Meaning, and Sonata Form in the ‘Sirens’ Episode of ‘Ulysses.’” *James Joyce Quarterly*, vol. 45, no. 1, University of Tulsa, 2007, pp. 85–96.

Pater, Walter. *The Renaissance: Studies in Art and Poetry*, edited by Donald L. Hill, University of California Press, 1980.

Raven, Simon. “The Strangeness of E. M. Forster.” *E. M. Forster: Interviews and Recollections*, edited by J. H. Stape, Palgrave Macmillan, 1993, pp. 156-161.

Rosencrance, Barbara. "*A Passage to India*: The Dominant Voice." *E. M. Forster: Centenary Revaluations*, Palgrave Macmillan, 1982, pp. 234-243.

Smith, D. J. "Music in the Victorian Novel." *The Kenyon Review*, vol. 25, no. 3, Kenyon College, 1963, pp. 517–32.

Sánchez Cuervo, Margarita Esther. "'Ah, but what is "herself"? I mean, what is a woman?': Rhetorical Analysis of Virginia Woolf's Feminist Essays." *ES. Revista de Filología Inglesa*, no. 31, 2010, pp. 263-286.

Sutton, Emma. *Virginia Woolf and Classical Music: Politics, Aesthetics, Form*. Edinburgh UP, 2013.

Varga, Adriana. "Introduction." *Virginia Woolf and Music*, edited by Adriana Varga, Indiana UP, 2014, pp. 1-23.

Weatherhead, Andrea K. "Howards End: Beethoven's Fifth." *Twentieth Century Literature*, vol. 31, no. 2/3, [Duke UP, Hofstra University], 1985, pp. 247–64.

Woolf, Virginia. "Mr Bennet and Mrs Brown." *Selected Essays*, edited by David Bradshaw, Oxford UP, 2009, pp. 83-88.

———. *Mrs Dalloway*, edited by David Bradshaw, Oxford UP, 2000.

———. "Poetry, Fiction and the Future." *Selected Essays*, edited by David Bradshaw, Oxford UP, 2009, pp. 136-149.

———. "The Novels of E. M. Forster (November 1927)." *E. M. Forster (Critical Heritage)*, edited by Philip Gardner, Routledge, 1997, pp. 319-328.

Wordsworth, William, and Samuel Taylor Coleridge. *Lyrical Ballads*, edited by R. L. Brett and A. R. Jones, Routledge, 2002.